

1 COURT CLERK: Thank you, have a seat.

2 Would you state your name for the record?

3 THE WITNESS: Yes, my name is Dr. William Manion.

4 COURT CLERK: Spell your first name.

5 THE WITNESS: W-I-L-L-I-A-M, M-A-N-I-O-N.

6 COURT CLERK: And your address, sir.

7 THE WITNESS: 4 Larsen Park Drive, Medford, New  
8 Jersey, M-E-D-F-O-R-D. Medford, New Jersey.

9 COURT CLERK: And the zip?

10 THE WITNESS: 08055.

11 COURT CLERK: Thank you.

12 THE COURT: You may inquire, Counsel.

13 MR. CERVINI: Thank you, Judge.

14 D O C T O R W I L L I A M M A N I O N, called as a witness  
15 by and on behalf of the Plaintiff, after having  
16 been first duly sworn, was examined and testified  
17 as follows:

18 DIRECT EXAMINATION

19 BY MR. CERVINI:

20 Q Good morning, Dr. Manion?

21 A Good morning.

22 Q Can you tell the jury what your occupation is, sir?

23 A Yes, I'm a pathologist working in New Jersey. I work  
24 as a hospital pathologist and also as a medical examiner in the  
25 counties of Burlington County and Ocean County, New Jersey.

1 Q And can you tell the folks what a pathologist -- your  
2 duties are about? What's a pathologist?

3 A Well, in the hospital, the pathologist runs all the  
4 labs like blood bank, microbiology, chemistry. When you get  
5 your blood drawn and there are tests to run, that's run in a  
6 laboratory, that's direct by a pathologist. We also look at  
7 biopsies. Anybody diagnosed with breast cancer, colon, lung  
8 cancer, those tissues come to someone like me, a pathologist,  
9 and we look at those tissues under a microscope to figure out  
10 what is the diagnosis.

11 In addition, we perform all of the autopsies. If  
12 patients die in a hospital, sometimes patients want an autopsy,  
13 families want to find out exactly what happened. Also, I work  
14 as a medical examiner and that involves the field of forensic  
15 pathology. And as a medical examiner, it's my job to figure out  
16 the cause and manner of death. For instance, did the person die  
17 naturally, did they have a heart attack or ammonia, was it a  
18 homicide, did somebody murder them, was it an accidental or a  
19 car accident or somebody electrocuted, that would be an  
20 accidental death. Was it a suicide, did the person leave a  
21 note, can we determine what happened. And then, finally, there  
22 is a "class undetermined". Sometimes it's hard to figure out  
23 why the person died and we have to do a lot of studies,  
24 toxicologies, get more medical records and more history.

25 So it's our job to determine cause and manner of death.

1 Q Can you briefly tell the jury here your educational  
2 background?

3 A Yes. May I get a glass of water, please?

4 With respect to college, I graduated from Villanova  
5 University in 1974 with a BA in Biology. I went on to graduate  
6 school at West Virginia University, and while I was at West  
7 Virginia, I entered medical school, also.

8 (Hanging)

9 THE WITNESS: Thank you, so much.

10 COURT CLERK: You are welcome.

11 A So that what happened, I combined both programs and  
12 graduated with my M.D. -- with my PhD, 1981, and my MD in 1982.  
13 I then did a pathology residency training program so I could  
14 become a hospital pathologist; that is, work in a hospital and  
15 direct laboratories, diagnose cancer. I did that at the  
16 Graduate Hospital in Philadelphia from 1982 to '86. I then did  
17 a year of forensic pathology training in Columbus Ohio at the  
18 Franklin County Coroner's office. I sat for my Board in 1986, I  
19 became board certified in anatomic and clinical pathology. In  
20 1987, I became board certified in forensic pathology.

21 Q Your PhD, what's your --

22 A In anatomy, and that involves gross anatomy where we  
23 would teach medical students all the parts of the body:  
24 Muscles, tendons, joints, bones, organs, cardiovascular system,  
25 renal system. All the different systems of the body. In

1 addition, we teach neuroanatomy: The brain. We study the brain  
2 and teach how the brain works and when there are certain  
3 injuries to the brain, what are the psychology of that. And we  
4 teach histology. And histology is looking at tissue under the  
5 microscope and saying, 'This is the section of liver, this is a  
6 section of kidney'. And just the normal histology.

7 Pathology involves diseases of the organs, so when we  
8 look at the liver as a pathologist, we may be trying to diagnose  
9 Hepatitis or cirrhosis or even cancer, hepatocellular cancer  
10 sometimes.

11 Q Do you hold any licenses presently in any sates?

12 A Yes, my medical license is in New Jersey, that's my  
13 active license. I have been licensed in other states, but since  
14 I don't practice there, they are inactive now. And that would  
15 include Ohio, Pennsylvania, New York, Delaware, I believe.  
16 Indiana, I have had inactive licenses there. I also completed a  
17 law degree in 1986 from Temple University in Philadelphia and I  
18 do have my law license, just so that I don't have to take the  
19 bar exam again. I try to keep them up to date so I don't have  
20 to sit for the bar again.

21 Q And any societies or associations you are affiliated  
22 with?

23 A Yes, namely the Pathology Society College and American  
24 Pathology, the American Society of Clinical Pathologists, and  
25 there is an organization, the National Association of Medical

1     Examiners, the name of the association.

2            Q     Now, you mentioned forensic pathology, and I apologize  
3     if I missed it. Can you tell the folks here, what is forensic  
4     pathology?

5            A     Well, forensic pathology involves deaths that are of  
6     legal interest. When people die in car accidents, people hit by  
7     a car, there may be prosecution for drunk driving or maybe  
8     prosecution for speeding, so that any death that is not a  
9     natural death has to be brought to the attention of a medical  
10    examiner. And if a doctor can't find that the person, you know,  
11    had a heart attack and died or had a stroke and died, then that  
12    case should come to the medical examiner's office because we  
13    want to make sure that the person did not die of something  
14    unusual, did not die of poisoning, for instance, did not die of  
15    some trauma that we don't know about.

16            Sometimes people can, you know, can fall and hit their  
17    head and think they are okay and go home and go to sleep and  
18    they are discovered dead the next day; that would be a medical  
19    examiner's case, why would this person, you know, die.

20            So that's where our main work is involved, making sure  
21    that we accurately determine cause and manner of death, document  
22    the autopsy we performed because we will later have to show our  
23    autopsy in court. And, often times -- we often times have to go  
24    before a grand jury and explain our autopsy finding.

25            My last appearance before the grand jury was in

1 Burlington County last week and I had a little baby that had  
2 been suffocated with a pillow and I had performed the autopsy  
3 and I had to go before the grand jury and explain why I believed  
4 that this was a suffocation of this child and why this child did  
5 not die of pneumonia or meningitis or mild myocardia or some  
6 disease that might explain her death.

7 Q You mentioned court. Let's take the last five or ten  
8 years; how often on an annual basis does your occupation involve  
9 the -- your coming to court to testify in front of people or  
10 judges or something other?

11 A In the last ten years, probably twenty-five times,  
12 thirty times. I think more frequent the last few years. My  
13 children are older now so I don't have to be at home, so my wife  
14 gives me permission to work on the side, so I testify every few  
15 months, every two or three months.

16 Q In those cases that you testified, is it a combination  
17 of private work where you work as a medical examiner? Give the  
18 folks idea as to how it breaks down.

19 A Most of it is private work. It may be med-mal cases,  
20 it may be criminal cases where I may be with the defense trying  
21 to defend someone in a case, they may be pain and suffering  
22 cases, and those are cases where a person was injured. Say they  
23 had a car accident and they were injured and before they died,  
24 they were conscious and did suffer and because of that, that  
25 case is of interest to jurors and attorneys.

1 Q And have you ever been used as an expert witness by any  
2 of the media?

3 A Well, yes, I worked as an expert consultant with the  
4 Nancy Grace show and Jane Velez Mitchell. And they had asked me  
5 on today but I told them I can't, I'm up in New York today so  
6 I'm going to be on tomorrow night.

7 Q How do you figure out when -- you don't come to court,  
8 for nothing, Doctor, obviously. Is there some kind of a rate  
9 that you charge for your time and how you allocate it?

10 A Yes, I have a fee schedule for reviewing cases. My fee  
11 is \$375 per hour, and then for courtroom testimony, it's \$3,000  
12 per half day, \$6,000 for a full day.

13 Q And how do you base that? How do you come up with  
14 those kind of numbers? Is there some office you have to cover?  
15 How do you figure out?

16 A Well, I have to pay another pathologist today to cover  
17 me, and it's like any other profession, whether it's plumbing or  
18 being an expert witness, there are going rates that are out  
19 there and I'm in about the middle of the going rate. I think  
20 Michael Boggin (phonetic) charges a lot more than me, but that's  
21 okay.

22 Q At some point in the recent past, have I contacted you  
23 before to explain some medical issues involving some of my  
24 cases?

25 A Yes, you did. Yes, you have.

1           Q     Can you give the jury an idea as how many times in the  
2 past have I called on you to explain medical issues involving  
3 some of my cases?

4           A     I think twice. I think I worked on two cases with you.

5           Q     Is today the first time that you and I have ever worked  
6 together in a courtroom where I have actually asked you  
7 questions?

8           A     Yes, today is the first time I answered questions.

9           Q     At some point in the recent past, did I contact you  
10 about the death of a young girl, Elvia Collado?

11          A     Yes, you did, that's correct.

12          Q     Did I provide you certain information regarding her  
13 death?

14          A     Yes.

15          Q     Can you give the jury an idea as to how much of the  
16 information I provided your office in order to assist in this  
17 case?

18          A     Ms. Collado was in a car accident and eventually died  
19 so I had for my review the accident investigation from the  
20 police, the injury medical records from the ambulance that took  
21 her out of the car and took her to the hospital. And then I  
22 also had a -- hospital records where you could see the doctors  
23 really tried hard to save her. And, finally, I had the autopsy  
24 report where a medical examiner or a forensic pathologist had to  
25 determine why she died and classified the death so that if there



1 was going to be prosecution, that could happen. And in this  
2 case, there eventually was prosecution.

3 Q And when I provided you this information, Doctor, did I  
4 give you an idea as to what I was trying to get, any issues  
5 solved for me and my clients?

6 A Yes, and it was to review the records, make sure I  
7 agreed with the autopsy. That she did, indeed, died from that  
8 car accident. And you also asked me about pain and suffering;  
9 did this individual suffer any, or was she conscious of this  
10 accident before she died?

11 MR. CERVINI: Judge, at this time, I would like if  
12 possible to take the subpoenaed hospital records which is,  
13 I believe, Plaintiff's 5 or 6 in evidence, so that the  
14 doctor would have it, along with Plaintiff's 5 or 6, the  
15 autopsy and I would like the doctor to look at these  
16 records that he's seen before. Thank you.

17 THE COURT: Yes, please show Plaintiff's 5 and 6  
18 to the doctor.

19 COURT CLERK: This is 5 and 6.

20 (Hanging)

21 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

22 MR. CERVINI: And, Judge, at some point, with the  
23 Court's permission, I have taken certain appropriate, I  
24 think, pages -- or relevant pages of those documents and  
25 blown them up on the board which I would like the doctor to

1 be able to explain at some point.

2 THE COURT: Yes.

3 MR. CERVINI: Thank you, Judge.

4 Q Okay. Doctor, can you tell the folks here what it is  
5 that you are looking at right now, the documents, themselves?

6 A Yes. This first set of records includes --

7 THE COURT: What exhibit are you looking at,  
8 Doctor?

9 THE WITNESS: Exhibit 5.

10 A This includes the medical records from the hospital  
11 where they attempted to save her. And I believe it has a death  
12 certificate, it has an operation record where they showed that  
13 they did take her to surgery, they opened her chest and tried to  
14 stop her bleeding. In fact, they even massaged her heart as  
15 they were transfusing her. They did everything they could to  
16 try and save her.

17 Q Is there any report in there from the Emergency  
18 personnel?

19 A I thought it was here, but I'm having trouble finding  
20 it. Let's see. Here it is, I have it. It's -- there are also  
21 injury records here.

22 MR. CERVINI: This is why I would like to start  
23 that process, Judge. There are two.

24 THE COURT: Yes.

25 MR. CERVINI: There are two pages, or one page in

1 particular that I would like to.

2 Q And, Doctor, could you pull that out if you like, using  
3 that clip, as long as we don't lose the clip.

4 A Okay.

5 MR. CERVINI: And I have that same page blown up,  
6 Judge?

7 THE COURT: Yes, please show it to Counsel.

8 MR. CERVINI: I apologize, Judge. I don't have  
9 that one.

10 Q Doctor, would you be kind enough to take out -- and you  
11 can unclip it if you don't mind because I don't think it's  
12 stapled together.

13 MR. CERVINI: With the Court's permission, can the  
14 doctor come down from the stand and utilize this page and  
15 maybe point out certain sections so I could ask him  
16 questions?

17 THE COURT: Yes.

18 MR. CERVINI: Thank you, Judge.

19 THE COURT: You may step down.

20 (Whereupon, the witness leaves the witness stand.)

21 THE WITNESS: This sheet is from --

22 THE COURT: Is there a question?

23 Q If you would be kind enough to hold up what's in  
24 evidence, what is it that we're looking at that's in evidence?

25 A This is the ambulance call report and this documents

1 that the Elvia Collado was the patient. And it documents some  
2 of her physical findings: Her pulse, her -- how fast the heart  
3 was beating, her respirations. And then something I want to  
4 address in particular, something called the Glasgow Coma Scale.

5 Q Can you tell the folks here, what is a Glasgow Coma  
6 Scale?

7 A Well, the Glasgow coma scale is a way for doctors to  
8 try to see, how conscious is a person, how do they respond. And  
9 they look at several things, they look at a motor response. For  
10 instance, we can say, 'Move your -- lift your right arm', can  
11 you respond like that. That would be normal. And it goes to  
12 the other extreme where you can pinch a person very hard and  
13 they don't even move, they don't feel anything. So we want to  
14 see what their motor response is.

15 We also want to see a verbal response. If I ask you a  
16 question, do you answer appropriately, that would be the highest  
17 score. I might ask you a question and you just had a head  
18 injury and you are so disoriented that you garble out something  
19 that makes no sense.

20 In other cases we might ask a question and, nothing;  
21 there is no response at all, so that would be the lowest score.

22 And finally, we look at how the eyes are, can you move  
23 your eyes and you can do it, do your eyes open when we approach  
24 you or, you know, is the person just in a full coma, they are  
25 not responding to anything. They don't respond verbally, they

1 -- they can't moves their eyes and there is no motor response,  
2 if we pinch them. So, it can go from one extreme to another, to  
3 the other. The lowest score is 3, highest score is 15. And it  
4 helps doctors try to gauge where is this patient right now in  
5 terms of treatment, because we're trying to get information from  
6 the patient. 'Where do you hurt' is the most important  
7 information. And in this case, she was not able to give that  
8 kind of information.

9 Q Now, this chart that you were talking about with these  
10 scores, is it part of your notes or anything in relation to your  
11 preparation to explain this to the jury?

12 A Yes. I always use it in cases because it comes up  
13 quite frequently, what was the person's Glasgow coma scale.  
14 Because, like I said, if it's 3, then the person is completely  
15 out of it. In a coma, for instance, up to 15, a person is  
16 pretty normal, but there are areas in between where we can judge  
17 it. And it's especially important, for instance, somebody might  
18 come in with a 15 and they have pain in their head and then you  
19 go back a half hour later and now they are down to 10, now that  
20 means something is going on. They might have a bleed in their  
21 head and as blood is pressing on the brain, they are having  
22 problems, so we got to jump on that patient right away.

23 MR. CERVINI: This page, I do have blown up,  
24 Judge. It's not part of the hospital record, I'm just  
25 offering it for demonstrative purposes.

1 THE COURT: Yes, have it marked for  
2 identification. Show it to Counsel.

3 (Whereupon, the blow-up of hospital record was  
4 received and marked Plaintiff's Exhibit 7 for  
5 identification.)

6 COURT CLERK: You want this now?

7 MR. CERVINI: If I could.

8 THE COURT: Is there any objection to Counsel  
9 using it for demonstrative purposes?

10 MR. LEONE: No.

11 Q So, Doctor, again, briefly, could you give us an idea  
12 of what we're looking at and explain it to us briefly?

13 A This was actually developed in Scotland in the city of  
14 Glasgow and it made such good sense with doctors that it was  
15 adopted around the world, so now it's the most widely used  
16 scoring system to qualify level of conscious following trauma,  
17 so that a doctor could hear, if her Glasgow coma scale is five,  
18 she is hurt pretty bad. On the other hand, if her Glasgow coma  
19 scale is 12 or 13, well, she is having some problems but she is  
20 pretty close to normal.

21 And as I mentioned before, we look at eye opening. For  
22 instance, if you open your eyes spontaneously, a normal person  
23 blinks and opens their eyes spontaneously. On the other hand,  
24 you may be shaken up and your eyes are just closed because you  
25 are hurting a little bit and the only way you will open your

1 eyes if we say, 'Can you open your eyes?' And if you respond to  
2 that, well, that's pretty good, that gets a score of 3.

3 Finally, if you can't open your eyes to voice, we pinch  
4 you, will you open your eyes and that will be a response to  
5 pain. And then the lowest score would be one; the person can't  
6 open their eyes even if you pinch them, they didn't even respond  
7 to pain so that's a bad sign.

8 The next is the verbal response. The doctor would come  
9 in and can they engage you in normal conversation; are you in  
10 disoriented conversation. That may be someone under the  
11 influence of drugs or alcohol. So someone -- or even someone  
12 having a stroke could be disoriented because they are having  
13 some pressure on their brain.

14 Finally, Number 3. The people will speak words but  
15 they are not coherent.

16 Number 2 would be no words, only sounds like moaning  
17 and groaning. And I'll emphasize this because Ms. Collado  
18 demonstrated a 2 in the Glasgow coma scale. When they asked  
19 her, 'Are you hurt? Where do you hurt?' She couldn't respond  
20 with any words, but she moaned and she groaned so she was  
21 feeling pain.

22 And then finally, if the person doesn't respond at all,  
23 again, that's probably a sign that they are in a coma, they are  
24 completely unconscious.

25 The last discusses motor response, do you have a normal

1 motor response where we can ask you to move your arm, can you  
2 move it, how do you react to pain and that would be, you know,  
3 if -- again, if we pinch you, sometimes, you know, someone has a  
4 stroke, they may be paralyzed on their right side and if you  
5 pinch them on their right side, they will take their left hand  
6 and push you away. They can't move their right side because  
7 they had a stroke, but they can still push you away. So that's  
8 called localizing to pain.

9 On the other hand, if they still have their motor  
10 system intact, if you pinch them, most people would pull their  
11 arm away; that would be withdrawal to pain. Then we get into  
12 certain postures. If people have suffered you no know, head  
13 injuries, they, you know, the extremities may curl up like that  
14 because of a blood and pressure in the brain, and this would be  
15 a bad sign that something is going on in the brain.

16 Finally, if there is no motor response, you know, you  
17 are concerned, do they have the transection of the spinal cord.  
18 For instance, if the person can't respond at all -- in other  
19 words, if they are probably completely paralyzed from the neck  
20 down. So this is the most popular way that we evaluate patients  
21 for consciousness.

22 Q Now, Doctor, using the EMS report of Ms. Collado,  
23 first, is there a time associated with the arrival of the EMS  
24 people?

25 A Let's see, I believe it says "On scene 05/02, 1:02



1 a.m.". Yes.

2 Q If you could just put it in front of the -- is there a  
3 spot? Okay.

4 A Okay, well, they were 01 --

5 Q Okay, using the -- what's in evidence, the EMS report,  
6 when they arrived, can you give us an idea, what is the EMS  
7 personnel documenting regarding Ms. Collado's physical  
8 condition?

9 A Well, they want to see, first of all, is she conscious  
10 at all, can she respond to anything. And when they did the  
11 Glasgow coma scale, coma score of tests, they found that her  
12 eyes wouldn't open, even to pain. Even if they pinched her, she  
13 couldn't open her eyes. However, when they pinched her, she did  
14 moan -- well, in terms of a verbal response, verbal response  
15 when they said where do you hurt, she could moan and groan and  
16 communicate in that degree, but she wasn't conscious enough to  
17 speak to them or say, 'My belly hurts, my chest hurts, my head  
18 hurts'. She couldn't do that. But when they said, "where are  
19 you hurting", she couldn't say any words but she could moan in  
20 response -- and groan in response.

21 So she could respond in some way, but as we'll see from  
22 the autopsy, she had suffered some mild head injury, some mild  
23 brain contusions and that was probably what was limiting her  
24 ability. I think after a person is in a serious car accident,  
25 you are probably in a little bit of shock yourself.

1           Finally, in terms a motor response, they could not get  
2 a good motor response and so they -- what they did, they got her  
3 out of the car, they intubated her.

4           Q     What does that mean?

5           A     The first thing you want to do is keep the air waves  
6 open, so they will put a tube down the throat into the trachea  
7 and they could move air out and in to her lungs, she could get  
8 oxygen.

9           Q     How does that effect anybody's ability to communicate  
10 with the medical emergency people, if at all?

11          A     Once that happens, the person can't verbally respond  
12 because they have a tube down their throat and they also receive  
13 the drug that paralyzed the throat muscle, so after that, they  
14 really can't respond very well. So after, the Glasgow coma  
15 scale may not be that accurate after the intubation.

16          Q     Are they recording anything, the emergency people  
17 regarding their pulse or blood pressure or anything like that?

18          A     Oh, yes.

19          Q     Where is that?

20          A     It's in the lower left-hand corner. And they stated at  
21 106, for instance, 'that's just 4 minutes after they arrived, her  
22 pulse was 142. Normal pulse is 70, 80. So, her pulse is rapid.  
23 Now what does that mean? Her pulse was probably rapid because  
24 she is bleeding inside and her heart has to work harder to move  
25 the blood along.

1 Q How do you know she was bleeding inside?

2 A Well --

3 Q Not at that moment, they didn't know. But how do you,  
4 based on your review of the documents, know that she was  
5 bleeding inside?

6 A Well, I've been able to see the whole case and I saw  
7 the operative report.

8 Q Okay?

9 A Where her main injuries were: Rib fractures. When she  
10 has ribs fracture, the end of the bones are very sharp and they  
11 actually go into the lung and the lung will start bleeding, so  
12 the blood will fill up the chest cavity. And, in fact, you have  
13 -- your lung is expanding like a balloon and sometimes you start  
14 bleeding so much that you collapse the lung, you collapse the  
15 balloon, and that's a serious situation where you can't breathe  
16 because blood is going up -- filling up your chest and what  
17 they do for that is, they make a hole in the side of the chest  
18 and put a chest tube in and drain that blood out so that the  
19 lung can expand and the person can get oxygen again. So --

20 Q So, I apologize. I interrupted you. You were telling  
21 us about the blood pressure and the --

22 A Yes. So her main -- I can tell you her main injuries  
23 were in the chest were bleeding and, in addition, she also had  
24 bleeding in the abdomen, the liver had lacerations and the  
25 spleen had lacerations. Spleen is a very fragile organ.

1 Sometimes people can be, you know, tackled in a football game  
2 and rupture the spleen. Sometimes people can be punched or hit  
3 with a bat and rupture.

4 The liver is a little bit tougher. To lacerate the  
5 liver, you have to be in a serious accident. I believe this was  
6 more of a seat accident, she was pulled forward and she  
7 sustained liver lacerations, spleen lacerations.

8 Q Are they recording respiration and pulse besides the  
9 first entry?

10 A Yes, they have -- let's see. Respiration is 36, pulse  
11 162. I think blood pressure was just palpable, her blood  
12 pressure was very low so that you couldn't get a good number.  
13 Now, what that means is, you have got to get this person to the  
14 hospital as soon as possible and start -- they -- I believe they  
15 started -- and I have, they tried to get saline in, but usually  
16 they can't give blood until we get them to the hospital, but as  
17 soon as she got to the hospital, they started -- you would start  
18 for O Negative blood because you don't have type-to-type, and  
19 you cross the blood and you would use O Negative because of an  
20 injury because we can all accept O Negative blood and it's the  
21 universal donor blood.

22 Q So using the personnel of -- the emergency personnel,  
23 what is it telling us about her level of consciousness at this  
24 time?

25 A It's low, her level of the consciousness is very low

1 and the only time she responds to is 'where are you hurting',  
2 she will moan and groan in an effort to communicate 'I am  
3 hurting'.

4 Q But she is conscious?

5 A Yes, a lower level of conscious. They -- for instance,  
6 they describe her as AB obtunded.

7 Q What is that, Doctor, obtunded?

8 A Obtunded means you are less alert, less oriented, maybe  
9 like in a stupor. Someone in an alcoholic or drug stupor, you  
10 would say they are obtunded. Somebody could be having a stroke  
11 and could be obtunded. Also, it's a term commonly used in  
12 medicine; when we hear it, we all understand that the person is  
13 out of it.

14 Q Can you give us an idea, what are the emergency people  
15 doing from the time they attend to her to the time they get her  
16 to the hospital? Based on the record, what things are they  
17 performing on her?

18 A Well, they have her with her bag, let's see, bivalve  
19 mask here. And then they are sucking her mouth, making sure if  
20 she is bleeding from the mouth, that she is not going to breathe  
21 in blood or aspirate blood because that could cause problems in  
22 the lungs. They have a cervical collar on her and a long-board.  
23 And, basically, they just want to get her to the hospital as  
24 soon as possible.

25 Q With this type of injury, would they be doing anything

1 to her chest or abdomen or anything such as that?

2 A Well, I don't believe so. They don't put a chest tube  
3 in on the field, you have to be at the hospital for surgery and  
4 stuff.

5 Q Now, can you get us to the next -- to the hospital  
6 records. Using the hospital record, I mean, there is a second  
7 page to the EMS report, Doctor, but --

8 THE COURT: Are you finished here?

9 MR. CERVINI: No, because I have another report  
10 with the hospital record, we're going to just go through  
11 several pages of the hospital report.

12 Q So you have seen -- you have looked at, you have  
13 reviewed her hospital record at Jamaica Hospital?

14 A Yes, she was Triaged. In other words, the ambulance is  
15 calling in and they are letting them know her signs --

16 Q Can you --

17 A -- this is serious.

18 Q Can you pick out what you believe would be the relevant  
19 section of the hospital record which would give us an  
20 understanding of Ms. Collado's level of consciousness at the  
21 hospital?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And I believe there is a sticker on the back, Doctor,  
24 so before we begin?

25 THE COURT: Before you show that, could we please

1 have that marked for identification. Show it to Counsel,  
2 first.

3 (Hanging)

4 MR. CERVINI: It's 2A in evidence, Judge.

5 THE COURT: Any objection?

6 MR. LEONE: No.

7 A All right. This is taken from the Jamaica Hospital  
8 Medical Center record, and let's see what they say about her.

9 I mean, initially, she is an unknown Hispanic female,  
10 you don't even have time to take their name or information.

11 MVC, I think that's "motor vehicle collision" with tree.

12 Passenger was restrained, so she was in her seat belt. These  
13 are things doctors deduce, a lot of information. If they are  
14 unrestrained, there are much more serious injuries. But if she  
15 is restrained, you are thinking she's got a chance. Glasgow  
16 coma scale of 5 on arrival.

17 Q So what does that mean?

18 A That means she improved a little bit in the Glasgow  
19 coma scale and so -- because she was getting oxygen because she  
20 was being resuscitated. And, like I said, when she hit the ER,  
21 they were putting tubes in her, IV tubes, and they start giving  
22 her blood because they have to replace the blood she is losing  
23 internally.

24 Q And what's her level of consciousness based upon your  
25 view of this?

1           A     It's a little bit higher than what it was in the field.  
2     It is improving, but later they are going to have to -- after  
3     they do the CAT scan and know what's going on, you are going to  
4     have to give her morphine, give her pain relief and take her to  
5     the operating room and to surgery, so they have to knock her out  
6     through anesthesia.

7           Q     I'm sorry, I cut you off. I stopped at the Glasgow  
8     coma scale of 5?

9           A     Right.

10          Q     Anything else?

11          A     Well, no obvious fracture or deformity. They checked  
12     her extremities, there is a facial laceration in the mandibular  
13     area; that was the obvious thing.

14          Q     Is there another page that -- of the hospital record  
15     that you think is relevant, Doctor, to tell this jury about Ms.  
16     Collado's level of consciousness at the hospital?

17          A     Yeah, here it is. Well, this is the -- what's called  
18     multi-system examination in the hospital. And this is kind of  
19     interesting because her blood pressure is now improving in the  
20     hospital. She is, you know, 115 over 76, that's a great blood  
21     pressure, that's a normal blood pressure. Her pulse has  
22     dropped; it was 140 before, now it's dropped to 108, so she is  
23     improving. They describe her as having a C-collar in place. We  
24     heard that before that the C-collar, cervical collar, was put in  
25     place; that's to make sure if the person has a broken neck, you



1 don't want to move the broken bones on each other because you  
2 might -- you might injure the spinal cord and hurt the person.  
3 So you -- because you want to get them a collar and get them  
4 stabilized. And then finally, here's that word I mentioned  
5 before, "obtunded", meaning she is out of it. But,  
6 nevertheless, she is in acute distress, they know she is  
7 suffering.

8 Q How is that?

9 A Well, she has, as I mentioned before, she has a Glasgow  
10 scale of 5, so now she's responding a little bit better and  
11 moaning and moving a little bit and coming back. She is still  
12 like a person that's stuporous or drunk, but she is responding  
13 better, but they know she is hurting and we have to get some  
14 morphine into her and get her into the operating room and get  
15 her under anesthesia and see what the heck is going on inside.

16 Q Would a doctor put down "acute distress" if the person  
17 was unconscious?

18 A No, if she was unconscious, they would say comatose.  
19 That tells you in one word, "comatose".

20 Q So when you say, Doctor, that she is out of it, what do  
21 you mean by that?

22 A Well, again, she -- you -- she is in a lower level of  
23 consciousness where she can only respond to questions about  
24 pain, she only gives a verbal response, she may not give -- I  
25 mentioned before, she may not be able to open her eyes with a --

1 if they say 'Open your eyes for us, look to the right or the  
2 left', she can't do that, so she is in something like a  
3 stuporous state or confused state or obtunded state where you  
4 are just out of it, but she can he respond to pain and she is  
5 described as being in acute distress.

6 Q Is there a part of the hospital record or the autopsy  
7 record that's in evidence, Doctor, which claims to these  
8 function, what injuries with these claims she suffered, what  
9 injuries she actually suffered?

10 A Yes, the autopsy record would show that and I think  
11 this pathologist did a very good job because he also had the  
12 hospital record and he reviewed the hospital record as well.

13 Q Can you show it to defense counsel? And would you be  
14 kind enough, Doctor, to tell the Court reporter what marking is  
15 on the back of it?

16 THE WITNESS: Plaintiff's -- Plaintiff's 2C.

17 MR. CERVINI: In evidence?

18 THE WITNESS: In evidence.

19 Q Now, can you tell the folks here what is it that we are  
20 a looking at?

21 A Well, this is the type of report that a medical  
22 examiner prepares. This is the type of report I would prepare  
23 where I list who is the person who died at the scene. This is  
24 the pathologist -- the forensic pathologist who performed this  
25 is Coreen Ambrosi, M.D. You have to be a physician to be a

1 forensic pathologist. She is working out of the Chief Medical  
2 Examiner's Office. We have got a medical examiner case number  
3 and the date of the autopsy, August 11. Now, her job -- the job  
4 of the forensic pathologist is to explain why did this person  
5 die. And she starts out by saying --

6 Q Would that include a review of this person's injury?

7 A Oh, yes. In fact, she had -- I know she had the  
8 medical record because she knew that she had had surgery at the  
9 hospital; she uses the words. She knows the patient had been  
10 operated on at the hospital, but let's run through it. And  
11 "Blunt impact to torso". Torso means your chest and abdomen.  
12 And she can see just when -- her outside exam that they are  
13 hemorrhages in soft tissue, bruises and hemorrhages. And then  
14 multiple rib fractures and disarticulation of the clavicle.  
15 Clavicle is your collar bone. I have a feeling maybe when the  
16 seat belt may have caught back and popped the clavicle off the  
17 sternum, it disarticulated it.

18 The major injuries here are the rib fractures because  
19 they caused lacerations and hemorrhages to the lungs. So the  
20 ribs fracture, they dig into the lungs, the lungs start bleeding  
21 and "HH" in -- the word for blood in the chest is hemothorax.  
22 Hemo means blood, thorax means chest. So she had a lot of blood  
23 in her chest. In fact, when they placed the chest tube, they  
24 drained two liters of blood. A person her size probably has  
25 five liters of blood in her whole circulation. If you lose a

1 liter, a liter and a half, that's very, very serious, and you  
2 will die if that's not replaced.

3 Q What does two liters of blood in that part of the body,  
4 what does the body experience if it's conscious?

5 A Well, the main pain a person experiences here in the  
6 chest injuries would be the rib fractures. And the ribs, if you  
7 think about it, the ribs are moving all the time because we're  
8 breathing all the time. The ribs got to move up as we inhale,  
9 move down to exhale. A lot of times a football player would get  
10 a rib fracture being tackled and they will put them in a flack  
11 jacket, heavy-impact jackets to try to protect them. But when  
12 someone has a rib fracture, we try to sling it and put a tight  
13 belt around it because you don't want it moving because if it's  
14 fractured and if the bones are rubbing against each other, that  
15 really hurts. And the joke -- it's a sick joke with the  
16 patients, but we'll say, 'Yeah, that guy has rib fractures; it  
17 only hurts when he breathes'.

18 Q And she was breathing?

19 A Absolutely, she was breathing.

20 Q So that would be the main pain there, from the chest.

21 Now -- and I think the pathologist and I agree, felt  
22 that these were -- the most fatal injuries and the bleeding at  
23 were in the chest, but she also addresses the abdomen. And  
24 mentioned hemoperitoneum, a fancy word for it, and "hema" means  
25 blood, peritoneum's in the abdomen cavity. Whenever there is

1 blood in the abdominal cavity, that would cause sharp pain. For  
2 instance, there is a condition, endometriosis, that women  
3 sometimes have where the endometrial tissue goes through the  
4 cycle, it will bleed inside the peritoneal cavity and that would  
5 cause a sharp pain. If you have appendicitis and it becomes  
6 inflamed and hemorrhagic, that causes pain. So any blood in the  
7 abdomen causes pain. So they are two sources of pain.

8           The reason she was moaning and groaning when they were  
9 asking her were, 'Are you hurting', she couldn't localize, she  
10 was too out of it and she could only groan and moan because she  
11 was feeling the pain of the rib fractures and the blood in the  
12 peritoneum?

13           Finally, they did mention impact to the head and neck  
14 and they mentioned something called a subarachnoid hemorrhage,  
15 and we're going to get into the brain just to finish it off.

16           Q     And, again, what number are we looking at, Doctor,  
17 and --

18           A     This next exhibit is Plaintiff's Exhibit 1C. And in  
19 this case, the medical examiner had a neuropathologist look at  
20 the brain. A neuropathologist is a pathologist that's an expert  
21 in the brain, he is an expert in brain trauma and, also, tumors  
22 of the brain. And let's look what he says: The main -- she did  
23 have some brain injury, something called subarachnoid hemorrhage  
24 which he calls mild. In other words, there was some bleeding on  
25 the surface of the brain, subarachnoid hemorrhage, and it -- the

1 arachnoid membrane coats the brain and the hemorrhage would be  
2 underneath it, so it's like a little layer of blood over the  
3 brain. This is a mild -- he says "mild", because a really  
4 severe injury would be subdural hematoma where the bleeding is  
5 so great that it fully pushes against the brain.

6           You know, if you think about it, the brain is inside  
7 the skull. Skull is not going to expand, so if you have a bleed  
8 in the skull, as the blood moves into the skull, it's going to  
9 compress the brain and in fact push your brain out through the  
10 bottom of your skull where your spinal cord is and that's called  
11 herniation of the brain and that will result in death. If your  
12 brain herniates, the centers for breathing and blood pressure  
13 are there; you will die if your brain herniates. So, there is  
14 mild subarachnoid hemorrhage.

15           And then he describes contusions and he says here,  
16 "Cross section of the cerebrum reveal few recent cortical  
17 contusions on the orbital gyri; that's just a part of the brain,  
18 close to the eye, the left temple. This is the left temple  
19 (indicating), and left superior temple.

20           Let me explain what a contusion is: When the person --  
21 when this decedent was in the accident and the car came to an  
22 abrupt stop, she was thrown forward and the seat belt held her  
23 back, but she suffered rib fractures, liver lacerations, spleen  
24 laceration and her brain went forward so hard that it actually  
25 bounced off the inside of the skull. The brain will actually

1 bounce, hit the inside of the skull and that's what caused these  
2 cortical contusions, little hemorrhages in the cortex that he  
3 could see.

4 Now, the type of injury is perfectly survivable, that  
5 -- there is not a fatal brain injury here. And this is what  
6 makes these cases very frustrating to doctors when they can't  
7 save somebody like this. If you try to save someone and then  
8 you later learn that they had a massive, you know, they had a  
9 skull fracture, a massive intracranial blood herniation of a  
10 brain, you know, you go, 'Well, we tried to save her but she was  
11 going to die anyway'.

12 But here, I want to emphasize, this is nothing -- there  
13 is nothing fatal about these injuries. If she could have  
14 survived her chest injuries, she would have walked out of that  
15 hospital.

16 Q What is it about the -- her head injuries that relates  
17 to her level of consciousness?

18 A Well, there is nothing here so severe. There isn't  
19 severe fractures, there isn't subdural blood. I mentioned,  
20 there is no bleeding inside the ventricles, there is no serious  
21 traumatic brain injuries that you would look at and say, 'She is  
22 in a coma'. She was not in a coma, she was not comatose.

23 Q Do you have an opinion based upon a reasonable degree  
24 of medical certainty in your field of forensic pathology,  
25 Doctor, as to the level of consciousness of Elvia from the scene

1 of the accident up until --

2 MR. CERVINI: I'll withdraw the question.

3 Q At some point, the doctor documented in the hospital  
4 chart, does Elvia go from consciousness to no consciousness and  
5 -- in other words, not aware of anything?

6 A Well, yes, because they have to take her to surgery so  
7 they are going to put her under the anesthesia.

8 Q And based upon your review of the hospital record, can  
9 you give these folks an idea as to when that was?

10 A I think that was around 1:50. Let's see.

11 Q Please, if you want to --

12 A Let me check.

13 THE COURT: Counsel, are you finished here?

14 MR. CERVINI: Almost, Judge. There is one more --

15 I don't have too much further, Judge.

16 A I recall it was around 1:55. I think she was conscious  
17 for about an hour, fifty minutes, roughly fifty minutes, then  
18 they have to get her under anesthesia and get her in OR and open  
19 her up and try to repair all these lung lacerations that she is  
20 bleeding from.

21 Q Can you summarize for us, what is Elvia experiencing  
22 during that one hour based on the hospital records, the EMS?

23 A She is moaning, she is groaning. She's been described  
24 as being in acute distress. She is in a lot of trouble now,  
25 it's in a lower level of consciousness, but she is still



1 conscious.

2 Q Is there some specific part of her body?

3 A Chest, rib fractures and the abdomen where the blood  
4 is, that's where most of the pain is coming from.

5 Q What is it about the area -- what would the body be  
6 experiencing, pain-wise?

7 A Well, like I said, very sharp pain from the rib  
8 fractures. And then the pain in the abdomen from bleeding, that  
9 people know about that that causes very sharp pain. If someone  
10 comes in complaining of sharp pain in the abdomen, that's  
11 something you are worried about; are they having a bleed, do  
12 they have a perforated ulcer, for instance, that's a sign. And  
13 you can't take a couple aspirin and ride that out overnight.  
14 That pain is terrible, it's probably like a kidney stone.  
15 Kidney stone is another type of pain where nobody can just stay  
16 home and take an aspirin and say 'I'll be fine tomorrow'.

17 Q Based on your emergency room record and the hospital  
18 record and the autopsy record, Doctor, do you have an opinion  
19 based on a reasonable degree of medical certainty in your field  
20 of expertise as to the competent producing cause of those  
21 injuries, what was it that caused those injuries?

22 A The cause of the injuries was the car accident.

23 Q And, Doctor, I think I have --

24 (Hanging)

25 A One last.

1 Q -- one last question.

2 A Whenever we perform an autopsy in the medical --

3 THE COURT: Excuse me. Please identify that  
4 exhibit.

5 MR. CERVINI: Yes.

6 THE WITNESS: This is Plaintiff's Exhibit, in  
7 evidence, 1D.

8 A Whenever we perform an autopsy on someone involved in a  
9 motor vehicle accident, we will do toxicology.

10 Q What is toxicology?

11 A Toxicology is where we might take blood or urine or  
12 even a fluid in the eye, that's the vitreous humor here;  
13 sometimes we'll submit liver gastric contents, what was in the  
14 person's stomach, do we find any pills in their stomach. So  
15 here, her -- they received -- they received blood, "specimen  
16 received". They received blood and so they performed toxicology  
17 tests and alcohol to see, you know, what -- was the person drunk  
18 or was the person on benzoylecgonine -- is KK --  
19 phenobarbitrates, phenabards, amphetamines, Benzodiazepines,  
20 Valium, antianxiety. Sometimes these are used illegally so we  
21 screen for these.

22 Q What, if anything, was found in Elvia's blood?

23 A Nothing. Absolutely nothing. No alcohol. Atomidine  
24 is a medication that we use in the hospital, lidocaine is an  
25 anesthetic we used.

1 Q What is the level of certainty of that toxicology  
2 report, Doctor?

3 A Well, this toxicology report was performed by the  
4 medical examiner's office, so this -- if this is going to come  
5 into court, this has to be done very carefully. We also do  
6 toxicologies in the hospital but not to the degree of certainty  
7 -- for instance, if a patient comes in, we will get -- sometimes  
8 if we think they are drinking too much, we will get a  
9 blood/alcohol and run it in the hospital to see, you know, they  
10 are really in trouble. Their blood alcohol is so high they may  
11 stop breathing. But normally the hospital blood/alcohol is not  
12 admitted into court. We would ask the police to take another  
13 specimen and 'Run that in your forensic laboratory' because  
14 that's going to be done more carefully and a better chain of  
15 custody. For instance, there is no mix up, this is her blood.

16 Q That's the type of report that we're looking at right  
17 now?

18 A That's correct.

19 Q Doctor, thank you, very much for coming. I appreciate  
20 it.

21 THE COURT: We'll take a five-minute recess.

22 COURT OFFICER: Jurors, please rise and follow me.  
23 The jury is exiting.

24 (Whereupon, the jury exits the courtroom.)

25 COURT OFFICER: Doctor, I'm going to ask that you

1 step all the way outside.

2 Thank you.

3 (Whereupon, a short recess is taken.)

4 THE COURT: You may be seated.

5 Excuse me, I think that some of those exhibits  
6 that were identified by the doctor are not --

7 MR. CERVINI: They are not. I'm sorry, Judge.

8 THE COURT: They were not identified as, or  
9 previously marked for the court records for identification.  
10 I know he identified them with an exhibit number, but were  
11 they identified?

12 MR. CERVINI: Yeah, they all have.

13 THE COURT: As the court record?

14 MR. CERVINI: He was reading, I apologize. I  
15 apologize, Judge.

16 THE COURT: Whatever it was, I just want to put  
17 that in the record. We could use the number that he used  
18 or a different one, but we have to put it in our record.

19 MR. CERVINI: I'll take care of that, Judge, and  
20 I'll put it on the record. They were exhibit markers from  
21 a previous trial.

22 THE COURT: We will take five minutes.

23 MR. CERVINI: Thank you.

24 (Whereupon, a short recess is taken.)

25 MR. CERVINI: It is hereby stipulated by myself on

PLAINTIFF - DR. WILLIAM MANION -- CROSS

100

1       behalf of the estate of Elvia and Ysidra Espinal that Dr.  
2       Manion's testimony, when he referred to -- one, two, three,  
3       four -- five boards which were blown up and he referred to  
4       exhibit numbers, they are not exhibit numbers --  
5       Plaintiff's Exhibit numbers in evidence in this trial.  
6       They were -- those are strictly numbers that the doctors  
7       referred to for identification purposes only as exhibits  
8       and those exhibits are not part of the evidentiary record  
9       in this case.

10               COURT OFFICER: Is that good enough? She put that  
11       on the record.

12               THE COURT: Okay.

13               Ready for the jury.

14               COURT OFFICER: All rise. The jury is entering.

15               (Whereupon, the jury enters the courtroom.)

16               COURT CLERK: All seven sworn jurors are present  
17       and in their proper positions.

18               Please be seated.

19               Doctor, you may be seated.

20               May I remind you, you were previously sworn and,  
21       as such, you remain under oath and you are still required  
22       to tell the truth. Do you understand?

23               THE WITNESS: Yes, I do.

24               MR. LEONE: Thank you, your Honor.

25       CROSS EXAMINATION

1 BY MR. LEONE:

2 Q Good afternoon, Doctor.

3 A Good afternoon.

4 Q In preparation for your testimony here today, did you  
5 prepare a report dated April 3, 2011?

6 A Yes, I did.

7 Q And that report was based upon statements and documents  
8 that you reviewed regarding this case?

9 A Yes, that's correct.

10 Q And if I'm not mistaken, that's the time that you gave  
11 for consciousness was approximately 1 o'clock when the accident  
12 happened until about 1:50 when the patient went under  
13 anesthesia?

14 A Yes, I will -- that's what I said, yes.

15 Q Now, did you take, as part of your analysis and as part  
16 of the report that you generated, did you review witness  
17 statements?

18 A Yes, I believe I listed on the front page of my report  
19 what I reviewed. I believe I did see witness statements, yes.

20 Q Did you review a witness statement in which the -- a  
21 witness had stated that he went over to check on the occupants  
22 in the Honda vehicle and commented that the female passenger,  
23 Ms. Collado, was not coherent? Do you recall that?

24 A Yes. That sounds accurate, yes.

25 Q And you noted that 1:03, the ambulance was at the

1 scene; is that an approximate --

2 A Yes, that's correct.

3 Q Now, at the scene, you had indicated that the  
4 attendants had generated a Glasgow score of some type, is that  
5 correct?

6 A Yes, that's correct.

7 Q And --

8 MR. LEONE: Your Honor, may I?

9 THE COURT: Yes.

10 Q Feel free to step down.

11 A Okay.

12 Q And what was the overall Glasgow coma score at the  
13 scene, do you know?

14 A Only four. Yes, it was four.

15 Q So that four then is comprised of -- I think you said  
16 there was Number 1?

17 A Eye opening: None.

18 Q So, wait. She did not open her eyes at all in relation  
19 to any pain?

20 A That's correct.

21 Q Okay. And her motor response was also none?

22 A That's correct.

23 Q Okay. So she also did not withdraw from pain which  
24 would be four or any of the other two categories, she didn't  
25 show any of those signs?

1           A     Well, they are pinching her and she is really not  
2 reacting to that.

3           Q     So you are saying that Number 2, then, the verbal  
4 response, she had no words, only sounds?

5           A     She is moaning and groaning when asked 'Where are you  
6 hurting'.

7           Q     Okay. And unless you were at the scene of the  
8 accident, would you know if they were asking her questions and  
9 she responded with only sound, or was she just making sounds in  
10 general? Would you know that?

11          A     Well, being that's what the Glasgow coma scale is, it's  
12 a verbal response. They are required to verbally respond. You  
13 ask them a question, they can answer appropriately.

14          Q     So, do you know that she was comprehending that  
15 somebody was asking her a question and she was unable to  
16 respond, or that she was making sounds in response? That she  
17 was just making sounds in general?

18          A     Oh, well, no. She was making sounds in response to  
19 questions, that's what the Glasgow coma scale is. If she was  
20 just moaning and groaning without any response to somebody  
21 asking a question, it would be 1, then.

22          Q     And they would normally pinch somebody at the scene of  
23 an accident to see if they would feel that in addition to the  
24 -- all other pain that they were going through, if any?

25          A     Yes, yes, they would.



1 Q Now, at 11 -- 1:11, we would have the hospital record,  
2 it's their arrival at the hospital?

3 A Very well, okay.

4 MR. LEONE: May I just go through these papers,  
5 your Honor?

6 THE COURT: Yes.

7 MR. LEONE: I just want to --

8 Q And if you don't mind leaving it on that page.

9 A Sure.

10 MR. LEONE: What time these documents say.

11 COURT OFFICER: Judge, should I take this down?

12 THE COURT: Are you finished with this exhibit?

13 MR. LEONE: I don't know.

14 A I have today's date. I'm having trouble finding. Is  
15 that 01/24, is that?

16 MR. LEONE: May I approach?

17 Q Would this be the time over here, 1:11?

18 A Oh, zero one, eleven, that's correct, that's the time.

19 Q So, at 1:11, about eleven minutes after the accident,  
20 would you say she was brought to the hospital and what is -- can  
21 you read any of that on the bottom?

22 A It's a very bad copy, but she was -- "Patient is on  
23 long board after being extricated from a car". It's very  
24 difficult to read this.

25 Q If I may direct your attention to line 5, the first

1 word in over here (indicating), can you read that? Right there,  
2 where it says -- which parts are starts with P?

3 A "Patient is" -- that may say unresponsive.

4 Q Okay. Okay.

5 A Unresponsive.

6 Q Thank you.

7 Now, on another page, there was two pages of the  
8 ambulance call report, I know one of them was blown up. I want  
9 to draw your attention to a page that was not blown up and shown  
10 to the jury yet?

11 A Very well.

12 Q This page right here, now that's about 1:30?

13 A Yes, 1:30 a.m., correct.

14 Q And at that point, did the patient lose consciousness?

15 A Well, it says here "Status post motor vehicle collision  
16 hit a tree, unresponsive", plus "loss of consciousness".

17 Q So at that point, the person was unconscious, correct?

18 A I believe she had a concussion at the scene of the  
19 accident and may have been unconscious there at the scene, but  
20 then she came back a little bit enough to be moaning and  
21 groaning, if somebody said to her, 'Are you hurting, are you in  
22 pain'. So I think, initially, she did have a loss of  
23 consciousness from the brain hitting the inside of the skull.

24 Q But you can't say from viewing those documents that  
25 they meant whether she was unconscious at the scene or whether

1 she was -- lost consciousness as she was unconscious at the  
2 hospital?

3 A Well, normally, the way it's phrased here, "Status post  
4 motor vehicle collision, hit a tree, unresponsive" and "loss of  
5 consciousness", that's important to know at the scene. That's  
6 much more important to know at the scene than at the hospital.

7 Q So do you know how long she was unconscious for at the  
8 scene?

9 A Well, she had a brief moment of unconsciousness until  
10 that Glasgow coma scale was administered.

11 Q And do you know whether that Glasgow coma scale was  
12 administered before she lost consciousness, after she gained  
13 consciousness?

14 A After -- no, no, no. She hit the tree, she would have  
15 a momentary loss of consciousness from a concussion. I had a  
16 concussion myself and lost consciousness one time so I feel like  
17 an expert on this because I have had it happen to me.

18 And after a concussion, after the brain hits the inside  
19 of the skull, you lose consciousness in a second that you can't  
20 communicate to other people, you can't communicate at all. So  
21 at the scene is when they want to document that.

22 When the ambulance arrived and they gave her the  
23 Glasgow coma scale, I think that was like 1:11, 1:14. A few  
24 minutes later, she was able to moan and groan. When they would  
25 say, "Where are you hurting", she was able to do that, but her

1 nervous system is being flooded with pain from her rib fractures  
2 and from her abdomen. So if you are in such terrible pain from  
3 all these other problems, if you pinch somebody, they may not  
4 respond to that because their nervous system is being  
5 overwhelmed with pain.

6 Q So then you know that the responses that she made, the  
7 sounds that she made, you know that they were in response to her  
8 -- to questions that were asked of her, "Are you in pain", you  
9 knew that she understood that?

10 A Well, that's -- well, if they weren't -- they weren't  
11 doing the Glasgow coma scale properly.

12 Q So could you tell me for what amount of time she was  
13 unconscious from the time that she had the accident up until the  
14 time that she was brought to the hospital?

15 A She came back then. Then, at the hospital, she is  
16 improving a little bit. They mentioned Glasgow coma scale of 5  
17 at the hospital so she is improving a little bit, but I think it  
18 was 10, they put her under and took her to the OR, so it's about  
19 maybe 40 minutes.

20 Q 40 minutes. Okay.

21 And of those 40 minutes, from 1 o'clock when the  
22 accident happened up until about 1:11, she was unconscious at  
23 some point or they would have known that?

24 A From personal experience, I was out of it for about  
25 five minutes then came to. It's amazing, it's like you are

1 asleep. And I hurt myself playing basketball and people told me  
2 I was crying and moving about, but I have no recollection of  
3 that. And then I was taken to the hospital and they amused  
4 (phonetic) it was a concussion and kept overnight. But it's  
5 quite a remarkable experience; you don't remember anything. You  
6 can be completely out it even though you can be walking and  
7 crying or trying to communicate.

8 Q As you were walking and crying, had they known that you  
9 had lost consciousness?

10 A Yes, I couldn't respond appropriately to anybody.

11 Q There is not a loss of consciousness in walking and  
12 crying?

13 A Yes, yes, you can walk and cry and still be  
14 unconscious. Yes, where you are not aware of what you are doing  
15 and people are just trying to help me back to call my dad.

16 Q So during that period of unconsciousness, then you were  
17 not experiencing pain and suffering either?

18 A When you are under a concussion, you are not conscious  
19 and you don't experience pain. When I became conscious, I was  
20 hurting.

21 Q Do you know when you have a concussion for what amount  
22 of time you were conscious where you can be experiencing pain  
23 and suffering?

24 A Well, by definition, concussion is a momentary loss of  
25 consciousness and usually it's for several minutes. And if she

1 had remained unconscious, they would have said comatose, they  
2 would have said -- they wouldn't even have talked about loss of  
3 consciousness, she's been comatose since the accident.

4 Q So if we took away five minutes of consciousness, then  
5 you would say that the total amount of consciousness that she  
6 had sustained through the accident until the time she went under  
7 anesthesia was about 35 minutes?

8 A I think it's 1:11 when that Glasgow coma scale was  
9 administered. So I think from 1:11 until 1:50 is around 35  
10 minutes?

11 Q I'm sorry, 39 minutes.

12 A 39 minutes or something, but she may have been  
13 unconscious between 1 -- 1 -- I don't know when she came out of  
14 it, but they definitely felt she lost consciousness.

15 Q Now, you said at the hospital it was Glasgow coma  
16 scale, 5?

17 A Yes. Yes.

18 Q Okay. So do you know how that 5 was comprised of those  
19 three categories? The numbers all together have to equal 5,  
20 right?

21 A Right. I have -- I don't know for sure, the guy didn't  
22 document which three things she checked.

23 Q So you can't say within a reasonable degree of medical  
24 certainty whether she was opening her eyes to pain or not, you  
25 don't know if she was at that level, right?

1           A     That's a possibility, but he didn't -- he just said  
2 Glasgow coma scale of 5, he didn't write down -- break it down.

3           Q     And you don't know whether her number was of her verbal  
4 response if she had any, did you?

5           A     Well, she may have been intubated at that point so they  
6 ignored that after that.

7           Q     And you don't know, likewise, what her -- what number  
8 she rated on the motor response scale?

9           A     That's correct, she did not -- she was not decerebrate.  
10 Decerebrate means the brain is not connected to the body  
11 anymore. Decerebrate. So I believe, just by elimination, she  
12 must have had some eye-opening to pain, that's the only type  
13 that's left.

14          Q     That's your opinion?

15          A     That's mathematics. If we had -- well, if we need 5,  
16 we have to have 2 from eye opening to pain; we already had the 2  
17 from moaning and groaning, 2 as a verbal response; and then we  
18 had -- we must have one because she is not decerebrate.

19          Q     The middle one, verbal response, 1, that doesn't  
20 measure pain at all, right? That doesn't measure her response  
21 at all to any type of pain?

22          A     No, they are talking to you.

23          Q     Okay. So theoretically, then, she may have had 1 for  
24 eye opening which means that she had no response to pain and she  
25 may have had 1 to motor response which means that she didn't

1 withdraw from any type of pain that was induced on her?

2 A All right, well, 1 plus 1 plus 1 doesn't equal 5.

3 Q Right?

4 A You have to correct.

5 Q So the middle -- her middle response may have been the  
6 greatest which does not measure her amount of pain or suffering,  
7 correct?

8 A Well, I guess if that was taken before she was  
9 intubated -- let's see. That's possible. Then if that was  
10 taken before she was intubated, yes.

11 Q You said that earlier this was a mild head injury; is  
12 that what you said --

13 A In terms of neuropathology, that's a mild head injury  
14 compared to what we see from car accidents.

15 Q This Glasgow coma scale that you used, isn't it true  
16 that any total number that's below 8, that's associated with  
17 severe injury, isn't that right?

18 A Yes. People -- this is considered potentially severe  
19 head injury, yes.

20 Q Okay. So, a number below it is a severe injury, the  
21 worst score is a 3, she's at a number 5 which is a pretty severe  
22 head injury, right?

23 A Well, we just have to be careful here. By severe head  
24 injury, I would mean we are having a massive bleed in the brain;  
25 that's what the real severe stuff is, where the patient is in a



1 car accident and then comes to the hospital and then you start  
2 seeing them go -- fall apart in front of you. They initially  
3 had a Glasgow come scale of 10 and then they start getting worst  
4 and worst. Then once they drop below 8, they are dropping below  
5 8 because they are having a massive hemorrhage in the brain.  
6 Then that's bad news, because you have to -- you had to get them  
7 to the OR. She did not have a massive hemorrhage injury to the  
8 brain.

9 Q But, any bleeding below 8, which you said is a severe  
10 head injury, would be a severe head injury, she scored 4 at the  
11 scene, and she scored 5 in the hospital, right?

12 A Well, she is not in that class of the type of severe  
13 injury that we're talking about, that someone would die from  
14 like a massive bleed, or a bleeding within the brain itself, an  
15 actual laceration of the brain. They did not have to operate on  
16 her head, they only had to operate on her chest. Those people  
17 you are looking at that had Glasgow coma scales dropping: 8, 8,  
18 8, 7, 6, you had to drill in the skull to get the blood out of  
19 it.

20 Q So this part of the scale, then, you don't agree where  
21 the number is anything below 8 is associated with a severe head  
22 injury, you don't agree that that's accurate?

23 A Nothing is a hundred percent in medicine. Nothing.

24 Q As part of the report that you generated, did you come  
25 to this conclusion: "She was conscious until there was massive

1     circulatory collapse and massive blood loss. As she reached the  
2     emergency room, her consciousness would have continued for many  
3     minutes after the accident". Do you recall?

4         A     Yes, that's correct.

5         Q     Thank you.

6                 MR. LEONE: I have nothing further.

7                 THE COURT: Redirect.

8                 MR. CERVINI: Just one or two.

9     DIRECT EXAMINATION

10    BY MR. CERVINI:

11         Q     Doctor, the section that the defense attorney was  
12     talking about, was that positive loss of consciousness, it's  
13     your opinion that that was a documentation that there was some  
14     loss of consciousness at the scene immediately following the  
15     accident?

16         A     At the scene, that's what the doctor told me. Now, was  
17     there any loss of consciousness, because the triage nurse will  
18     get you to a CAT scan faster. That's a dangerous sign. If you  
19     lose consciousness, your brain may have hit the inside of your  
20     skull, you may have actually had a concussion and we have to see  
21     how bad that concussion injury is. Here it is very mild in  
22     terms of a little subarachnoid hemorrhage and mild cortical  
23     contusions that the pathologist found at the time of autopsy.

24         Q     And you know that that period of unconsciousness at the  
25     scene didn't last, if I understand you correctly, because of the

1 Glasgow coma scale as documented by EMS?

2 A When she -- they got at the scene, she was beginning to  
3 moan and grown. When they hollered at her, "Are you hurt, can  
4 you feel pain", all she did was moan and groan. And she may not  
5 respond to a pinch because she is being overwhelmed with pain  
6 from her chest and abdomen. I'm sure when I had my kidney  
7 stone, if you pinched me -- that wouldn't bother you at all if  
8 you were having a kidney stone attack.

9 Q So if she wasn't comatose but totally unconscious when  
10 those EMS people got to the scene, what would have been her  
11 Glasgow coma scale?

12 A 3.

13 Q 3 or under?

14 A 3 or under. And they wouldn't have said, 'Loss of  
15 consciousness -- loss of consciousness, came back'. They would  
16 have said 'comatose'.

17 Q And the Glasgow coma scale that was documented on her  
18 arrival was actually high?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And anyplace on the hospital record before they take  
21 her to the OR to open her up, is there anything in that record  
22 -- in that hospital record that said that she was comatose?

23 A Nothing at all.

24 THE COURT: Any cross?

25 MR. LEONE: No, your Honor.