



SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK  
COUNTY OF BRONX

-----X  
STANLEY PINA, AN INFANT BY HIS M/N/G  
ERICA ABREU AND ERICA ABREU, INDIVIDUALLY,

Index No.: 350430/11

Plaintiffs,

-against-

Present:

MELEEN CHUANG, M.D., ERIN CONROY, M.D.  
and MONTEFIORE MEDICAL CENTER,

HON. ALISON Y. TUITT

Defendants.

-----X

**VERDICT SHEET**

**AT LEAST FIVE (5) JURORS MUST AGREE ON EACH QUESTION.**

1. DID THE DEFENDANT, ERIN CONROY, M.D., DEPART FROM GOOD AND ACCEPTED MEDICAL PRACTICE IN THE PERFORMANCE OF THE UTERINE INCISION ON AUGUST 25, 2011?

Yes  
YES OR NO

5-1  
6-0 OR 5-1

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTIONS WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW.

1. \_\_\_\_\_  
2. Col. D. [Signature]  
3. clair [Signature]

4. Jose' Thomas  
5. CB [Signature]  
6. Liny Montilla

Pina v. Chuang

I, THE UNDERSIGNED DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER

DISSENTING JUROR *[Signature]*

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTION "1" WAS "YES" PROCEED TO QUESTION "2".

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTION "1" WAS "NO" PROCEED TO QUESTION "3".

2. WAS THIS DEPARTURE A SUBSTANTIAL FACTOR IN CAUSING INJURY TO PLAINTIFF STANLEY PINA?

Yes  
YES OR NO

6-0  
6-0 OR 5-1

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTIONS WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW:

- 1. *[Signature]*
- 2. *[Signature]*
- 3. clair Rasthat

- 4. *[Signature]*
- 5. Chaktoe
- 6. *[Signature]*

I, THE UNDERSIGNED DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR \_\_\_\_\_

PROCEED TO QUESTION "3"

3. DID DEFENDANT, DR. MELEEN CHUANG DEPART FROM GOOD AND ACCEPTED MEDICAL PRACTICE IN HER SUPERVISION AND/OR HER PARTICIPATION OF THE UTERINE INCISION BY DR. CONROY ON AUGUST 25, 2011

Pina v Chuang

Yes  
YES OR NO

5-1  
6-0 OR 5-1

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTIONS WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW:

- 1. \_\_\_\_\_
- 2. [Signature]
- 3. clara Rashad

- 4. Jose' Rivera
- 5. Matthew
- 6. Liny Montilla

I, THE UNDERSIGNED DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR [Signature]

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTION "3" WAS "YES" PROCEED TO QUESTION "4".

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTION "3" WAS "NO" AND YOUR ANSWERS TO QUESTION "1" OR QUESTION "2" WAS "NO", STOP AND PROCEED NO FURTHER AND REPORT TO THE COURT.

4. WAS THIS DEPARTURE A SUBSTANTIAL FACTOR IN CAUSING INJURY TO PLAINTIFF STANLEY PINA?

Yes  
YES OR NO

6-0  
6-0 OR 5-1

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTIONS WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW.

- 1. [Signature]

- 4. Jose' Rivera

Pina v. Chuang

2. [Signature]

3. clair Prashad

5. [Signature]

6. Triny Montilla

I, THE UNDERSIGNED DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR \_\_\_\_\_

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTION "4" IS "NO" AND YOUR ANSWER TO EITHER QUESTION "1" OR QUESTION "2" IS "NO", STOP PROCEED NO FURTHER AND REPORT VERDICT TO THE COURT.

IF YOUR ANSWER TO QUESTIONS "1" "2" "3" AND "4" ARE "YES" ANSWER QUESTION "5", OTHERWISE PROCEED TO QUESTION 6.

5. WHAT IS THE PERCENTAGE OF FAULT TO EACH DEFENDANT?

ERIN CONROY, M.D. 50 %

MELEEN CHANG, M.D. 50 %

TOTAL MUST EQUAL 100%

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTIONS WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW:

1. [Signature]

2. [Signature]

3. clair Prashad

4. [Signature]

5. [Signature]

6. Triny Montilla

I, THE UNDERSIGNED DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR \_\_\_\_\_

PROCEED TO QUESTION 6.

Pina v. Chuang

6. STATE THE AMOUNT AWARDED FOR THE CONSCIOUS PAIN AND SUFFERING, IF ANY, INCURRED BY PLAINTIFF STANLEY PINA FOR THE PERIOD OF AUGUST 25, 2011 THROUGH THE PRESENT.

IF YOU DECIDE NOT TO MAKE AN AWARD, YOU WILL INSERT THE WORD "NONE."

INSERT AMOUNT \$ 150,000.00

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTION, WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW

1. CP [Signature]  
2. [Signature]  
3. Darr Raskin

4. Jose Thomas  
5. Chloe  
6. Lily Montilla

I, THE UNDERSIGNED JUROR, DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR: \_\_\_\_\_

PROCEED TO QUESTION "7".

7. STATE THE AMOUNT AWARDED FOR THE CONSCIOUS PAIN AND SUFFERING, IF ANY, FOR PLAINTIFF STANLEY PINA FROM THE DATE OF YOUR VERDICT INTO THE FUTURE.

IF YOU MAKE AN AWARD TO COMPENSATE FOR THE PLAINTIFF FOR THE PAIN AND SUFFERING DAMAGES TO BE INCURRED INTO THE FUTURE, YOU MUST STATE THE PERIOD OF YEARS WHICH SUCH AMOUNT IS INTENDED TO PROVIDE COMPENSATION.

IF YOU DECIDE NOT TO MAKE AN AWARD, YOU WILL INSERT THE WORD "NONE."

INSERT AMOUNT \$ 250,000.00

NUMBER OF YEARS: 21

Pina v. Chuang

JURORS, AFTER ANSWERING THE ABOVE QUESTION, WILL SIGN THEIR NAMES BELOW:

- 1. \_\_\_\_\_
- 2. [Signature]
- 3. clair Raske
- 4. Jose' Ponce
- 5. Chatter
- 6. Lirio Montilla

I, THE UNDERSIGNED JUROR, DO NOT AGREE WITH THE ABOVE ANSWER.

DISSENTING JUROR: [Signature]

**WE, THE UNDERSIGNED JURORS, DULY SAY THAT WE HAVE RENDERED A VERDICT IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ANSWERS TO THE ABOVE QUESTIONS:**

**ALL JURORS MUST SIGN BELOW:**

- 1. [Signature]
- 2. [Signature]
- 3. clair Raske
- 4. Jose' Ponce
- 5. Chatter
- 6. Lirio Montilla